Creative Industry and Women Writers as Labor in the Platform Economy

Industri Kreatif dan Penulis Perempuan sebagai Tenaga Kerja dalam Ekonomi Platform

Zulfa Ruhama1, Ary Nilandari2
1 Kementerian Koordinator Bidang Pembangunan Manusia dan Kebudayaan, Indonesia
2 Universitas Terbuka, Indonesia

Corresponding Author
Zulfa Ruhama
zulfairy@yahoo.com

Article History
Received: 12 May 2023
Final Revision: 26 June 2023
Accepted: 27 June 2023
Available Online: 30 June 2023

Abstract
Starting from non-commercial, user-generated content, grassroots alternative to the industry-controlled major publishers, web-novel writing in Indonesia has formalized business model and grown bigger with the influx of capital. Very little is known about the mutually shaping relationship of the online creative writing market in Indonesia for women in the wider context of the creative labor debate. This paper will analyze the inception of online writing jobs in Indonesia, before probing the formalization process, taking into account all the associated precarity of informal labor. It then looks into its economic and socio-cultural implications, such as the impact on the formal market and how it can improve employment conditions for creative labor. The findings suggest that writing in the platform economy is typecast as women jobs, with many web novel platforms marketing strategies caters to women audiences. Its further growth and expansion will lead to the empowerment and employment of more women in the platform economy. However, women writer working in platform economy in Indonesia are very vulnerable, with most of them occupying the middle-low payment jobs that require complex skills. The proper regulation establishment from government and education about basic employee rights can improve employment conditions for women writers in platform economy.

Keywords
Future of Work; Platform; Web Novel; Women Labor; Creative Writing

Abstrak

Kata Kunci
Platform; Web Novel; Penulis Perempuan; Pekerjaan Masa Depan
1. Introduction

The discussion surrounding creative industry or creative economy carries many elements, but it is certain that creative industry is an essential part of the modern economic structure and it will be increasingly significant for the future of work (Bujor & Avasilcai, 2016). From definition, creative economy itself is basically an economic activity that utilizes creativity to create a product that is unique and has innovations that have selling value (Pratt, 2021). The creative economy is born from people who think creatively and are aware of the existence of science, technology, and culture. Therefore creative industry or creative economy is mainly about putting economic impact or economic growth on cultural and arts (Belfiore, 2020).

The development of science and technology, especially information technology, is correlated with the increasing variety of human logic and thinking. In Indonesia, cyber literature emerged around 2001 along with the spread of the internet. Cyber literature is a literary activity that utilizes computer and internet facilities, which is a transformation in the world of literature. Before cyber literature became known, the publication of literary works only limited to existing publishing technology. The products were known as newspaper literature, magazine literature, or book literature, which uses newspapers, magazines, or books as a medium for its dissemination. Cyber literature is part of the cultural and creative industries where information technology become its main driver with economic, openness and universality narratives (Campbell et al., 2019).

As early as 2002, online platforms started to emerge as the media for digital transformations in writing, reading, and publishing. The digital books that are written, edited, and published online on the platforms are mostly in the genre of fiction, which explains the term "web fiction", and later, the term web novels are used to indicate a longer work. For the sake of simplicity, from this point onwards, author will use “web novel” for the work of literature available primarily or solely on the internet. Web novels mostly exist on web pages or platforms, having free-to-read and pay-to-read formats.

2. Methods

This research will use an exploratory qualitative approach. The definition of qualitative research is a research approach that seeks to explore and explore a central problem or phenomenon with the aim of being able to understand it (Creswell et al., 1996: 252). The exploratory qualitative research approach was chosen by the researcher because the issue platform economy and how it benefits women labor in creative industry requires case mapping that involves intensive exploration and tracing from various sources and analysis of these data to produce a narrative conclusion.

3. Results and Discussion

Web-novel is a creative product of cultural innovation. In China, web novel has become a kind of business and cultural channel to spread influence to the world. Following the thriving multibillion-dollar business at home, Chinese web novel platforms look to sell their stories — and their innovative way of mass production — to literature lovers abroad. And it is working. Chinese analytics firm iResearch reported that Chinese online literature has captivated 145 million overseas audiences. China’s web novel industry becomes the most successful 21st-century cultural export and the only pop culture industry in the whole of China that did not lose out to foreign countries. Foreign readers visiting the Wuxia world of Chinese online literature are fascinated. TV series like Nirvana in Fire, Legend of Fuyao, Story of Yanxi Palace, Battle through Heaven, and The Untamed, visualized the stories they read, and China’s cultural output became more noteworthy. The Chinese idol drama is gaining popularity throughout Southeast Asia, including Japan and South Korea (Ni, 2022). As TV series made their way overseas, China’s web novel industry is not shying away. Bytedance, a Chinese company that owns Tik Tok launched Fictum or Fizzo, a reading and writing platform targeting North American and Indonesian markets (Yang, 2021).

In Canada, Wattpad.com was founded in 2006, and soon the platform gained momentum in Indonesia, providing free access to read and write web novels for the audience as young as 13 years old to adults. Wattpad recently has been acquired by South Korea’s Naver Corporation for a US$ 600 million cash-and-stock deal.
It is a prominent platform that allows users to read stories created by other users, or write and publish their own stories. Wattpad has a monthly audience of more than 90 million users as of November 2021, with 70% of them being female and 80% being Millennials or Gen Z. The platform has published more than a billion stories over the years in more than 50 languages and claims that its users spend a collective 22 billion minutes per month reading these stories.

After amassing millions of users and their stories circulating in the platform, Wattpad is expanding its business beyond web pages. The rise of the streaming industry like Netflix and Hulu has maintained a growing demand for stories to be adapted into TV shows and movies. Wattpad is sitting on a wealth of intellectual property consisting of teen drama, mysteries, romances ready to be offered to streaming industries. Wattpad announce the establishment of Wattpad Studio in 2018 and Wattpad Webtoon in 2021 to support the seamless transition of their stories from web-novel format to TV shows, miniseries, or film (Alexander, 2021). Wattpad also tap into the country-specific content market with Wattpad signing cooperation with Iflix, a streaming company based in Indonesia to convert stories from Indonesian Wattpad writers into streaming content. So far, 26 web novels adaptation is in production (Jayakarta News, 2018).

In Indonesia, web novel has proliferated in popularity at first for pragmatic reasons: (1) for aspiring writers, web novel is easy to publish, saving the long and winding effort only to get a rejection or a very slim possibility of being published by a major book publisher, it also enables them to connect directly to their readers; (2) for readers, web novel is much cheaper than a paper book and easy to carry around in their gadgets. They can even read a few first chapters for free and decide to buy the rest only if they like the story, which cannot happen with the cling-wrapped novel in the bookstore. The benefits nurture readers and writers. When a writer puts in extra effort to produce decent work and promote it on social media, the readership grows exponentially.

The ever-growing readership of web novels evokes the publishing industry to embrace the already established market, moreover with the acceleration of 4.0 industry prompted by worldwide Covid-19 pandemic. When the pandemic hits, around 96% major book publishers in Indonesia experienced a decline in conventional book sales (printed books). As a result, 55% of publishers are considering terminating work relationship (PHK) of their employees. While 1 in 4 publishers decide to stop

### Table 1. Online Web Novel Platforms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>App/Platforms</th>
<th>Downloads</th>
<th>In-app purchases</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Wattpad (English and Indonesian)</td>
<td>100M+</td>
<td>IDR 5,000-1,309,898 per item</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Webnovel</td>
<td>10M+</td>
<td>IDR 13,000-4,296,919 per item</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Goodnovel (English and Indonesian)</td>
<td>5M+</td>
<td>IDR 16,000-1,822,967 per item</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Dreame (English and Indonesian)</td>
<td>10M+</td>
<td>IDR 4,000-690,000 per item</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Webfic (English)</td>
<td>1M+</td>
<td>IDR 14,000-2,127,521 per item</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Fictum/Fizzo (English and Indonesian)</td>
<td>10M+</td>
<td>IDR 16,000,000 per item</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Novelme (Indonesian)</td>
<td>5M+</td>
<td>IDR 3,000-1,000,000 per item</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>KBM App (Indonesian)</td>
<td>1M+</td>
<td>IDR 15,000-1,000,000 per item</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Karyakarsa (Indonesian)</td>
<td>500k+</td>
<td>IDR 7,500-289,000 per item</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Storial (Indonesian)</td>
<td>100k+</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Cabaca (Indonesian)</td>
<td>100k+</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Kwikku (Indonesian)</td>
<td>50k+</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Google Play Store, as of 15 June 2022.
the production of printed books and also try to expand their digital channels to sell books (Kementerian Pariwisata, 2020). In 2021, Indonesia creative economy has contributed to the increase in Gross Domestic Product (GDP) as much as IDR 1,274 trillion (Putra et al., 2022). Publishing, including e-publishing, is one of the seventeen designated creative subsectors in Indonesia. In Creative Economy: Indonesia’s New Power Towards 2025 (Kementerian Pariwisata, 2014), publishing is defined as “an effort or activity to manage information and imagination to create creative content that has a certain uniqueness, expressed in writing, images and audio or a combination thereof, produced for public consumption, through printed media, online media using electronic devices, or new media to get value economic, social or artistic and cultural higher”.

The e-publishing industry makes up a gig economy or platform economy, where a large number of people work in part-time or temporary positions or as independent contractors. The platforms connect with clients or customers, readers in this case, through their websites or apps (Daugareilh et al., 2019). They hire platform-based workers, and a wide variety of positions fall into the category of a gig which is a job that is temporary or freelance and performed on an informal or on-demand basis. Administrator, editor, writer, translator, et cetera, in the platform economy most of them are categorized in creative and multimedia business who are much more likely to be part-time workers and to work from home. Considering IDR 3.4 million as the average of gig workers’ paid salary in Indonesia, the business model in platform economy offers a creative, competitive, and promising alternative for society to get income (Faisal et al., 2019).

Among the best-known, online web novel platforms in Indonesia are Wattpad (global), Novelme (global), Fictum (global), Storial (local), Cabaca (local), and the recently emerged KBM App (local). These and other similar startups are ‘disruptors’ of the established major publishers’ markets. The influence of these web novel platforms is also credited to cultivate new market niches, not only by providing an easier way for writers and readers to interact but also by bringing additional providers that cater to the need of the writers and also the platform, for example, content creators, influencers, and online book stores.

Public interests in web novels have made major publishers in Indonesia such as Gramedia Pustaka Utama and Mizan started to create their online writing platform with GWP.ID and Rakata respectively. Others opted to maintain a presence in the already established web-novel platform, instead of building their platform. Bentang Belia, one of Bentang Pustaka’s imprints, can be found actively engaging readers through their account in Wattpad. Grasindo, KataDepan, Nourapublishing, and also Clover Publishing, did the same though mostly they provide snippets or early chapters of their newly or soon to be published physical books to entice readers.
For the same reason, Storial.Co, Karya Karsa, and Kwiku also founded as an internet digital entertainment company. These local platforms aim at the Indonesian market. They promote themselves as a digital storytelling platform that allows writers to write per chapter, engage with readers and monetize their stories. Proceeding into the same trajectory as Wattpad, Storial and Kwiku also cooperates with production houses to adapt web novels in their platform into content for the streaming industry. Metamorfosa Cacing and One More Chance TV series are two among the adapted works from Storial (Genflix, n.d.) Kwiku routinely held writing events with screenwriter or movie director from production houses as judges. These events potentially connect talented writers with production companies and agencies.

Web novel writing has become a new path of career for Indonesian content creators. The prospect of becoming a popular web novel author, gaining a steady income, and signing a film contract is so alluring that reader-only turning into writer-also becomes a common phenomenon. As Annie Proulx puts it, “Writing comes from reading, and reading is the finest teacher to write (Proulx, 2020)”. Reading and writing become inseparable in the platforms where necessary convenience is provided. Consequently, what started as a social networking platform for readers and writers, now become the medium that can reel them into the intricacies of the entertainment industry, with women writers being significant contributors. The creative economic statistic of 2020 confirmed that most of the Indonesian population who works in the Creative Economic sector is women. Whereas average wages in publishing subsectors is up to IDR 3.165.868 in 2019 (Kementerian Pariwisata dan Ekonomi Kreatif dan Badan Pusat Statistik, 2020)

Although there is not a conclusive survey on Indonesian user profiles across web novel platforms, small-scale surveys show a significant proportion of women. For instance, KBM stated that from 389 respondents all over Indonesia in 2021, most of them are housewives who write online web novels (Khaerunnisa, 2021). Jakpat Survey reported in 2018 that from 1269 respondents of Wattpad users, half of them are women. Reflecting on the data from South Korea about women’s domination in web novels writing and reading, Indonesia may see a similar trend. Therefore, the empowerment of women writers in this unique industry becomes imperative.

3.1. Web Novel Writers in Digital (C)age: Very Little is Known

Many online platforms uphold similar ideals about web novel writers. Wattpad talks about building connections between people with your stories; Storial talks about empowering Indonesian writers to make a better living through writing and turn their stories into multiple formats. Storial’s CEO stated that by writing stories in storial, some of our writers received royalty each month up to 5 times regional minimum wage (Akbar, 2020).
Karya Karsa founders highlight one of their writer who has managed to earn 5 million per month since starting to write at their platform 4 months ago and another writer who can earn over than 30 million per month through a 7-month process writing in Karya Karsa (Tamat, 2020). KBM talks about giving income opportunities to untrained housewives who turn to web novel writers during the pandemic time. As of November 2021, KBM’s head chief claimed the profit-sharing given to the web novel authors in KBM has reached 12 billion rupiahs (Paskalis, 2021). On average, the respondents claimed to have an average income of IDR 1 million from KBM, which they used on family needs. Almost all respondents, or 94% of them, claimed KBM has helped their household income which was affected by the pandemic. People may now even be more familiar with KBM for recently viral ‘Layangan Putus’, a hit TV series loosely adapted from one of the stories posted in KBM Facebook groups. However, very little is known about how much web novel industries benefit their writers on average, and how the algorithms behind royalty arrangements or payment distribution. Some platform has been transparent and encouraging, yet many more are expected to show good intentions.

A variety of jobs offered in web novel industries share similarities with typical work in the platform economy. Based on skill, level, and payment, types of work in web novel platform can be divided into complex jobs requiring high skills and low skill jobs requiring less-complex skills. Figure 1 presents a typology of work in a web novel platform adapted from Forde’s typology of work in the platform economy (Stuart, 2017; Vallas & Schor, 2020)

The CEO of the web-novel platform sits at the top of the figure; they are the ones that Forde designated as ‘platform architects’. The CEO can simply be the founder of the platforms or also the builder of the platforms. The CEO or any C-level executives in the platform are in short supply, attributed to having the highest skills and complexity of work, and being paid the most. Under the platform architects, some technologists build the system and analyze data from the platform.

The lowest group is the workers of the web novel platform who has to surf between roles—frequently unpaid ones—building their readership and creating content with little help from the platform. The workers of web novel platforms need to learn and master a specific set of skills from writing to content-making to marketing, but they are in the lowest-paid group. Just like an independent contractor, the workers are pushed to exhibit entrepreneurial behavior. In addition, the workers in the web novel platforms are very susceptible to every change made by the platform, their market conditions, and regulatory policy. At any time, platforms can change one-sidedly their policies regarding the minimum number of words to be submitted for a writer to get paid. Today the minimum number is 20.000 words, next month it can be more. Platforms also one-sidedly decide on the revenue share for the writer. In addition, platforms secure the right to draft a contract in which all work arrangements are decided unilaterally and at the platform’s discretion. Writers will only have to accept or leave it.

The lack of regulation on the practice of web novel platforms in Indonesia makes the workers susceptible to being exploited under a convoluted license agreement. Concerns include the fact that even though the license agreement is non-exclusive and time-limited, it is also irrevocable. In other words, writers are not trapped indefinitely but have no right to cancel. Writers must also waive their moral rights to be acknowledged as the author and to protect their work from changes that would be detrimental to the work or the author; and a clause that severely limits authors’ ability to speak truthfully about their experiences (Strauss, 2021).

There are key similarities between the job quality determinants and results of remote gig work, particularly the significance of algorithmic control in the operation of online labor platforms. Platform-based systems of rating and ranking enable algorithmic management techniques that facilitate autonomy, task complexity, and variety, as well as spatial and temporal flexibility. The partnership in the platform economy mostly uses algorithmic decisions (number of likes, views, or sales) to measure a writer’s performance. If a web novel fails to reach the required audiences, it may be excluded from the promotion or may be suspended from the pay-to-read setting.

Algorithmic control may give remote platform workers freedom over where they work and how to
Salus Cultura: Jurnal Pembangunan Manusia dan Kebudayaan, 3(1) 2023, pp. 68-77

manage their working hours. Most employees, however, were required to work long and irregular hours in seclusion to meet client demand. The autonomy provided by algorithmic control can result in excessive work, sleep deprivation, and exhaustion (Wood et al., 2019). Such a situation is bound to happen every time a web novel platform demands their writers to write a minimum of 150,000 words or more in a limited time, with convoluted rules as to when they can take a day off writing or not, as a precondition to access cash bonus or other benefits.

Web novel writer in the platform economy is also trapped in an underemployment condition (Feldman, 1996). Different from unemployment, underemployment is defined as a condition where workers are being underused because the job does not fit their skills, when workers are working part-time, or when a job leaves workers idle. Cases of underemployment include working part-time despite wishing to work full-time, and over qualification, which occurs when an employee has more education, experience, or skills than is required for the job. Web novel writers mostly rely on short-term job contracts, from one contract to another, offering their works and skills without knowing exactly when contract opportunities will arrive or when their works will be accepted by platform agencies. The situation is worsened by the constant supply of web novel writers partly because of the never-ending recruitment of writers on the platforms. They use methods like giving new writers a fixed payment to subsidize the early stage of slow audience growth. It has been very effective to cultivate and sustain authors, which also means fierce competition to win readership. In such an arrangement, planning can become very difficult because anything can start or end at a moment’s notice. Being a web novel writers may be very close to what Southwood described as laborers who expected to be waiting outside the metaphorical factory gates with their boots on, every morning without fail (Southwood, 2011).

Cultural Theorists, Mark Fisher, wrote about privatization of stress and depressing realism of the new labor in platform economy. The remote nature of web novel writing gives a sense of control to writers about their working location, though in reality writers have little choice but to work from home. The working hours and payment can always be increased or reduced based on regulations set by the platforms. Oftentimes, the long hours of workers in the platform economy can lead to a lack of isolated feelings and a lack of social exchanges. The freelance or independent contractor status is given to the writers in the contracts also waives the platforms from the obligation of health insurance or fixed minimum wage. Privatization of stress means the tendency of a company to shift all the stress emanated or associated with the work to their workers, by making the work more precarious (Fisher, 2011). Digital labor resulted from platforms which offer cloud work in the form of for the mediation of paid services that are web-based and not bound to a specific location. The profit of platforms come mainly from their digital labor, independent contractors who still have to pay for their computers, electricity, and access to the internet as means of production (Schmidt, 2017).

Rachel Cheung’s article about the life of a web novel writer in China gives an in-depth portrayal of how the system of web novel platforms works. The writer has to dedicate himself to writing and marketing for months to get scrapes from the platform, yet his effort may be or may not be futile in the end (Cheung, 2018). Traditional business often treats innovation as a means to an end and a competitive factor for traditional entrepreneurs, but innovation is a goal and an objective in itself for workers in creative industries. Business models in the creative industries are based on a fast-paced production rhythm where innovation has to occur all the time: year after year, season after season or publication after publication (Koch et al., 2023). The ‘innovate or perish’ situation is shouldered by all creative entrepreneurs in platform economy, but more stress is given to their workers as they can be easily substituted if they could not keep up to the innovation rhythm.

The situation with web novel writers is akin to what has been transpiring from workers’ conditions in the transport and delivery platforms that dominated Indonesia’s platform economy. Conclusion withdrawn by Indonesia Fairwork Indonesia Ratings 2021 report suggests that pay and working conditions in Indonesia’s platform economy fall well short of decent work standards and that reforms are needed to develop a fairer...
Creative Industry and Women Writers as Labor in the Platform Economy

and more equitable gig economy. Some of the challenges experienced by Indonesian platform workers are the absence of labor rights; subjective challenges for women workers; the impact of COVID-19 that has caused job termination and poverty for some workers, and wearing overload for others (Fairwork Indonesia, 2021). Some of the workers in the transport and delivery platforms in Indonesia like Gojek and Grab had policies and practices to protect workers from risks arising at work, such as accident insurance and emergency helplines. Gojek and Grab also provided further support for workers that could include some form of access to health insurance, sick pay compensation for those infected with COVID-19. This is a good practice that should be implemented if web novel platforms aim for a healthy working environment for their writers, especially full-time writers who are yet to have access to such benefits.

4. Conclusion

There is still very little academic study about women labor in the platform economy in Indonesia, pieces of evidence are still needed, many aspects are still open to be explored and discussed to further understand how many women work in the platform economy, why they choose to work in it, how they are treated from it, and how regulators should respond. However, all of this should not hinder us from the fact that this is one of the windows to look into the future of work. Web novel platforms might become a solution for creatives in the field. When the door of conventional publishers closes, women writers have alternative doors to open. In the process, writing would give them not only a medium for self-actualization or stress-relieving activity but also financial gain when they have mass readership and followers. With million readers online, a web novel in print will secure much more than the break-even point from offline readers. Conventional publishers would offer the writer a book contract with a standard royalty, and few of the web novels would make a book-to-movie adaptation.

For many writers, that is not the case at all. Gaining loyal readers is hard. Monetizing their work is even harder. In this situation, various web novel platforms emerge and give them an irresistible offer, not without a catch, as explained above. In this article, we have deliberated on the hierarchy of web-novel platforms and identified several challenges and obstacles to their workers, and try to shed light on the potential of this particular sector for Indonesia’s future workforce and for the quality of creative content they will provide.

Even though web novels, as source stories, have a great potential to turn into various adaptations, they gain more market value through their utilization rather than their worth as a web novel itself. All in all, the significant worth of web novels for the business is that they cost less to start with, but have proven to be an incredible tool to test the marketability of animations, movies, and dramas that are relatively risky. This mindset will always set the platforms to aggressively soliciting content while putting the web novel writers on shaky ground. That is unfortunate, not just because of the unfavorable contract terms discussed above, but also because the writers being approached by the platforms are among the naivest, many of whom are teenagers, college students, and housewives.

Technology development and the rise of platform working ecosystem have compelled us to redefine what is considered decent work today. Questions arise also on the consequences of these changes have brought. Nevertheless, it is imperative to identify which ministry or body in the government is responsible for regulating the web novel industry and by doing so protecting the rights and improving the wellbeing of the workers as the most valuable assets in the business. It’s their skills, knowledge, and experience after all that propel the industry ahead. Believing in the talent and potential of the workers, the government should also devote a portion of its tax revenues to invest and help them reach that potential.

Should web novel platforms, global and local based, abide by Indonesian law of employment and labor when drafting a contract with the writer? If the answer is yes, which Indonesian law should they follow? The goal is to create a document that is both legally binding and as close to all parties’ desires as possible, ensuring that the document is concise and clear. It is imperative also for writers to self-educate on their rights as platform workers and the value of their works in the platform economy. They should seek to improve the quality of their works. A great number of the audience does not always mean a good quality of work. Last but not least, the writer-
community or professional association should empower its members with the necessary knowledge and skills. Those issues call for further research to provide recommendations for proper management.

References


